County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

CARDIFF CAERDYDD

AGENDA

Committee	ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
Date and Time of Meeting	FRIDAY, 11 NOVEMBER 2016, 4.45 PM
Venue	COMMITTEE ROOM 4 - COUNTY HALL
Membership	Councillor McKerlich (Chair) Councillors Dilwar Ali, Howells, Hyde, Simmons and Stubbs

Time approx.

1   Apologies for Absence   4.45 pm

To receive apologies for absence.

2   Declarations of Interest

To be made at the start of the agenda item in question, in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

3   Minutes *(Pages 1 - 6)*

To approve as a correct record, the minutes of the previous meeting on 6 October 2016.

4   Libraries performance *(Pages 7 - 26)*   4.50 pm

A – Welsh Public Library Standards Annual Report 2015-16
B – Summer Reading Challenge 2016

(a) Councillor Peter Bradbury (Cabinet Member for Community Development, Co-Operatives and Social Enterprise) will be invited to make a brief statement;

(b) Sarah McGill (Director – Communities, Housing and Customer Services) and Isabelle Bignall (Head of Service – Customer Services) will be in attendance to provide a presentation and to answer Members' questions;

(c) Questions from Committee Members.

5   **Dumballs Road Regeneration** *(Pages 27 - 30)*   5.35 pm

(a) The Leader, Councillor Phil Bale, will be invited to make a brief statement;

(b) Neil Hanratty (Director – Economic Development) will be in attendance and will provide a short presentation on the proposals for Dumballs Road. They will also be available to answer any questions that Members may have.

(c) Questions from Committee Members.

Supplementary information to this report is exempt from publication because it contains information of the kind described in paragraphs 14 and 21 of parts 4 and 5 of Schedule 12A to the Local Government Act 1972. It is viewed that, in all the circumstances of the case, the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information.

6   **Way Forward**   6.30 pm

7   **Date of next meeting**

The next meeting of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee is Thursday 8 December 2016 at 4.30 pm in Committee Room 4.

Davina Fiore
Director Governance & Legal Services
Date: Monday, 7 November 2016
Contact: Andrea Redmond, 029 2087 2434, a.redmond@cardiff.gov.uk

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

6 OCTOBER 2016

Present: County Councillor McKerlich(Chairperson)
             County Councillors Dilwar Ali, Howells, Hyde and Simmons

15   :   APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

No apologies for absence were received however Councillor Howells had advised the Chairman that he would be late arriving.

16   :   DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

17   :   MINUTES

The minutes of the meetings held on 9 June 2016 and 21 July 2016 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

18   :   SUPPORT FOR START-UPS AND ENTREPRENEURIAL BUSINESSES

The Chairperson welcomed the Leader, Councillor Phil Bale, Jon Day Economic Policy Manager and Warren Fauvel Cardiff Start to the meeting.

Members were provided with a presentation on Support for Start-Ups and Entrepreneurial Businesses; the Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members;

- Members asked how many start-up workshops there were in Cardiff. Officers didn't have the information to hand but the Leader noted that most of the workshops were in the South and West of the City.

- Members asked for information such as rent charged per square metre, length of stay allowable and the size of the units. Officers stated that the rent was at the lower end of the spectrum but would come back to Members with a full analysis of information on the units, including the units behind Western Avenue.

- Members noted that Newport have small units for people starting out, then they are able to move to bigger units as their businesses grow and asked if Cardiff had the same. Officers confirmed that start-ups would have access to larger spaces as they grew but ultimately they would be encouraged to move out to their own premises when their business reached a level of maturity.

- Members asked if technical support was provided to start-ups and were advised that they would be signposted to Business Wales for technical support. The Leader added that in Europe it was common for the Economic Development Function to provide support; with the City Deal, Economic Development and Strategic Planning was starting to be looked at on a regional

basis; he added that Brexit had opened up discussions regarding European Funds and having to look at different models.

- Members asked about waiting times for a start-up unit; Officers agreed to provide this information after the meeting. Members were concerned that that there was a lack of information available at the meeting.

- With regard to the Tramshed, Members asked if the Council had any influence over how people make bookings; Officers agreed to speak to the owner/management about this.

- Members asked for more information on the Cardiff Capital Fund, officers advised that equity investments had been a success and were still in operation beating market performance; officers were expecting loan repayments to replenish over the next year or so, performance had improved as the fund has gone on. Members noted that a huge amount had been achieved from what was invested and considered there may be problems if the fund is depleted and loans are used instead. Officers stated that the approach would then be to leverage partner investments. The Leader added that partnerships with creative industries such as S4C had already been developed, there were also other funds to access such as the Social Innovation Fund; there had been huge cuts to the service area and may functions remain with just minimum staff, therefore decisions had to be made on what to prioritise, and networks such as Cardiff Start have been identified for support.

Members were provided with a presentation from Warren Fauvel of Cardiff Start; the Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members;

- Members asked how Mr Fauvel was involved with the Council and were advised that he was independent from the Council, the only involvement was that Cardiff Start was funded in part by the Council.

- Members were advised that Cardiff Start provides mentoring, advice and support for founders. The Leader added that he visited the founders Hub on the day that it closed and he realised that there needs to be suitability of infrastructure in the City and issues such as the speed of broadband need to be considered when developing future spaces; Cardiff competes with others and needs to have a high profile, therefore it is important to develop partnerships with universities and others.

- Members asked how people can get in contact with Cardiff Start and were advised that they are a community of people who advise and support each other, they are very active on Facebook, twitter and have a website; they also have a live event list and people are often referred via word of mouth.

The Chairperson thanked Officers and the Leader for attending the meeting.

AGREED – That the Chairperson writes on the Committee's behalf to the Leader to convey their comments and observations.

19   :   FLAT HOLM ISLAND PARTNERSHIP

The Chairperson invited Councillor Bob Derbyshire (Cabinet Member - Environment), Jon Maidment (Operation Manager Parks & Sport) and Natalie Taylor (Team Leader) to the meeting.

The Chairperson also invited external witnesses Cellan Michael (RSPB) and Peter Sampson (Flat Holm Society) to the meeting.

The Chairperson invited the Cabinet Member to make a statement in which he said that he was pleased to bring this item to Committee, the last time it had been was over three years ago, since then there had been lots of progress and there was a strong interest in the topic. Flat Holm Island provided lots of challenges; it needed to be protected and improved and to provide an enhanced visitor experience.

Members were provided with a presentation which included an update on Flat Holm Island; the Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members;

- Members asked if match funding would be needed and were advised that it would be; Members were also advised that landfill tax funding was available to Flat Holm Island currently.

- Members asked what the vision for Flat Holm Island would be if the grant application was successful. Cellan Michael stated that they would wish to take forward partner efforts, make the island sustainable, be realistic with what can be achieved with the Island's heritage and make the most of the iconic location of an island off shore a capital city. The Cabinet Member added that Flat Holm had so much to offer such as nature, birds, historical value, gun turrets, the Marconi story, tides and landing stages; but this needed to be balanced, consideration needed to be given to visitor numbers and breeding seasons for example. He added that engaging with more schools would provide the opportunity to widen awareness about the island.

- Members sought clarification on the freshwater on the island. Officers advised that there had been an issue around 5 years ago and they had looked at bore hole options but this had proved to be too costly; currently the water system was working ok with a new filter and ultra violet systems so was passing water quality tests; bore holes have not been ruled out for the future though if needed.

- With regard to soil contamination, Members were advised that officers have been working with the university but unfortunately were no further forward with this. The lead in the soil means that they island cannot produce eggs/meat but it does provide interesting research opportunities for universities.

- Members asked for an update on the Lewis Alexander and were advised that the boat used to bring groups to the island quite easily but unfortunately there was no longer the budget to fund it, it was important therefore to improve links with commercial operators going forward.

- With regard to the Heliport, officers advised that they had looked at opportunities but they had not been hugely positive; the Heliport has contracts with organisations such as the BBC and therefore did not have the flexibility to transport passengers; this was however three years ago and could be further explored. Officers added that hopefully now the RSPB were on board and with the increased marketing this would provide there may be opportunities to explore with helicopters in the South West to transport visitors, especially in the winter non breeding season months. The experience with Ramsey Island, with an exclusive contract with a boat company with limited numbers of visitors to ensure there is no environmental damage.

- With regard to lease/water access, officers advised that they currently hold the lease and there are no suggestions that this would not be continued.

- It was noted that visitors to the island are guided by the tides and that lots of trips are cancelled due to rough sea.

- Members made reference to volunteers carrying out maintenance work on the island; Mr Sampson stated that volunteers go regularly and maintain and reinstate buildings. The Cabinet Member added that it was a shame that the National Trust were no longer involved especially with regard to the buildings, but discussions were ongoing with other organisations for help and expertise in restoring buildings and maintaining ruins such as the cholera hospital. It was noted in relation to the hospital that it should be managed in the short term as a ruin and maybe in the long-term partners could restore it; however, the HLF bid was for £500k and a seven figure sum would be needed to restore the hospital.

- With reference to the HLF bid, Members asked what the selling point would be and were advised that the RSPB are currently working on various component parts and will meet shortly to discuss built heritage, visitors, accommodation on the island, school partnerships and interpretation on and off the island. Officers added that better links to the island and mainland also needed to be established with improved signposts and accessibility; officers were looking at the Barrage Café as a good opportunity to make this link.

The Chairperson thanked Officers and the Leader for attending the meeting.

AGREED – That the Chairperson writes on the Committee's behalf to the Leader to convey their comments and observations.

20   :   COMMITTEE BUSINESS

Members were provided with a work programme and asked for their views on whether any topics should be added. Members considered that a topic on the Castle could be included in the new year and it was noted that the work programme as it stands provides a degree of flex for topics to be added or moved.

Members noted that all correspondence was up to date.

21 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

It was noted that the date of the next meeting would need to be changed. The principal scrutiny officer would circulate a list of available to date to Members by email and determine a suitable date.

This page is intentionally left blank

CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

DINAS A SIR CAERDYDD

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE   **11 NOVEMBER 2016**

LIBRARIES PERFORMANCE

Report Overview

1.   This report is split into two sections, providing Members with appropriate information to consider the following areas of the Library Service:

- Welsh Public Library Standards – Annual Report 2015/16
- Summer Reading Challenge 2016

A. WELSH PUBLIC LIBRARY STANDARDS – ANNUAL REPORT 2015/16

Purpose of Report

2.   To update the Committee on the performance of Cardiff Libraries against the *Fifth Assessment Framework for Welsh Public Library Standards (WPLS): Annual Report 2015/16*. The Committee has monitored the Council's progress against the Standards for a number of years and agreed to continue to do so as part the work programme confirmed in October 2016.

Background

3.   The Welsh Government launched the first set of Public Library Standards (WPLS) for Welsh authorities in 2001, to be implemented over a three year period from 2002/03 to 2004/05. This was a set of national standards with a procedure for performance management that generated comparative performance information. It was intended as a support mechanism to effect improvements and greater efficiency in libraries, which local authorities have a

statutory duty to provide under the Public Libraries and Museums Act 1964. There is consensus within the library profession and across local authorities that the Standards have driven improvement in libraries across Wales.

4.   The fifth quality framework of Welsh Public Standards 2014-2017 – *'Libraries Making a Difference'*, has been developed to monitor how well library services deliver benefits such as literacy, digital inclusion, cohesive communities, and health and well-being for the people of Wales. This framework has moved away from the standards and performance indicators used in previous years and has instead introduced core entitlements and quality indicators to measure the impact of library services. The full document can be found via the following link: https://goo.gl/JHrV7B .

5.   The desired outcome of the fifth framework is that libraries deliver all the services and facilities listed as core entitlements. The framework has been themed around four areas of core service, with each containing a number of core entitlements and quality indicators. The core services and related entitlements are as follows:

Customers and Communities
- **WPLSCE 1** – Libraries in Wales will ensure friendly, knowledgeable and qualified staff are on hand to help.
- **WPLSCE 2** – Libraries in Wales will stage a range of activities to support learning, enjoyment and enable users to obtain the maximum benefit from the available resources.
- **WPLSCE 3** – Libraries in Wales will provide access to a range of services and resources to support lifelong learning, personal well being and development, and community participation.

Access for All
- **WPLSCE 4** – Libraries in Wales will be open to all members of their communities.
- **WPLSCE 5** – Libraries in Wales will be free to join.
- **WPLSCE 6** – Libraries in Wales will provide a safe, attractive and accessible physical space with suitable opening hours.

Page 8

- **WPLSCE 7** – Libraries in Wales will provide appropriate services, facilities and information resources for individuals and groups with special needs. Special needs can be caused by physical and health impairment, economic disadvantage (e.g. long term unemployment), cultural difference (e.g. language, new arrivals), educational background, or other circumstances that require special library services.

Learning for Life
- **WPLSCE 8** – Libraries in Wales will lend books for free.
- **WPLSCE 9** – Libraries in Wales will deliver free access to information.
- **WPLSCE 10** – Libraries in Wales will provide free use of the Internet and computers, including Wi-Fi.
- **WPLSCE 11** – Libraries in Wales will deliver free use of online information resources 24 hours a day.
- **WPLSCE 12** – Libraries in Wales will provide access to high quality resources in a range of formats, including those in the Welsh language, reflecting changing forms of publication.
- **WPLSCE 13** – Libraries in Wales will share their catalogues, to enable a single search of all Welsh library resources.

Leadership and Development
- **WPLSCE 14** – Libraries in Wales will promote libraries to attract more people to benefit from their services.
- **WPLSCE 15** – Libraries in Wales will regularly consult users to gather their views on the service and information about their changing needs.
- **WPLSCE 16** – Libraries in Wales will work in partnership to open up access to the resources of all Welsh libraries.
- **WPLSCE 17** – Libraries in Wales will provide access to the library service's strategy, policies, objectives and vision, in print and online, in a range of languages appropriate for the community.
- **WPLSCE 18** – Libraries in Wales will provide a clear, timely and transparent complaints process if things go wrong.

6.   The quality of these services and facilities, and the achievement of the core entitlements will be assessed against a broad range of performance indicators

and outcome-based measures – these are referred to as Quality Indicators (WPLSQI) and can be found listed throughout the document ''*Libraries Making a Difference'.*

Annual Report 2015/16

7.   It is a duty of the Welsh Ministers to superintend and promote the improvement of public library services in Wales. In accordance with this duty the Welsh Government undertakes an Annual Review of each local authority library service. The Museums, Archives and Libraries (CyMAL) Department's evaluation of Cardiff's performance was received in September 2016 and can be found attached at **Appendix A**. The evaluation is based on self assessment data submitted by the authority against each Core Entitlement (WPLSCE) and Quality Indicator (WPLSQI).

8.   The evaluation found that:

- Cardiff is meeting all 18 core entitlements in full (in 2014/15 Cardiff met 17 of the 18 core entitlements in full, and partially met one)
- Of the seven quality indicators which have targets, Cardiff achieved three in full, two in part and failed to achieve two (in 2014/15 this was four in full, two in part and failed to achieve one)
- The Council's Library Service has key strengths in community engagement and its visitor levels
- The main areas of concern are the staffing and acquisitions budgets (the same areas identified in 2014/15).

9.   The Core Entitlement Cardiff is now meeting, which was not met in 2015/15, is **WPLSCE 15 – Libraries in Wales will regularly consult users to gather their views on the service and information about their changing needs**. Customer surveys and consultation was carried out in February 2016 following a period where the Service had not carried out a standard user survey for a number of years.

10. The Annual Assessment report splits the Quality Indicators into three sections:1) Quality indicators with targets; 2) impact measures; and 3) quality performance indicators and benchmarks. Below is the overview of Cardiff's performance against the quality indicator standards.

Quality Indicators with targets – Cardiff is achieving 3 in full, 2 in part and failing to achieve 2 of the indicators – as shown in the table below. In comparison with 2014/15, performance against QI 9 has declined from fully met to partial; performance against QI 10 has improved from partially to fully met; and QI 16 has declined from fully met to not met.

Quality Indicator		Met?	
QI 3 Individual development:			Met in full
	a) ICT support	✓	
	b) Skills training	✓	
	c) Information literacy	✓	
	d) E-government support	✓	
	e) Reader development	✓	
QI 5 Location of service points		✓	Met in full
QI 8 Up-to-date reading material:			Not met
	a) Acquisitions per capita	✗	
	or Materials spend per capita	✗	
	b) Replenishment rate	✗	
QI 9 Appropriate reading material:			Partially met
	a) % of material budget on children	✗	
	b) % of material budget spent on Welsh	✗	
	or Spend on Welsh per capita	✓	
QI 10 Online access:			Met in full
	a) All service points	✓	
	Computers per capita	✓	
	b) Wi-Fi provision	✓	
QI 13 Staffing levels and qualifications:			Partially met
	a) Staff per capita	✗	
	b) Professional staff per capita	✗	
	c) Head of service qualification/training	✓	
	d) CPD percentage	✓	
QI 16 Opening hours per capita		✗	Not met

Impact measures – In 2014/15 Cardiff did not report any figures in this area as it did not conduct any impact surveys. The table below ranks Cardiff in comparison with other authorities returning the relevant data (where 1 is the highest scoring authority).

Performance indicator		Rank	Lowest	Median	Highest
QI 1 Making a difference					
b) % of children who think that the library helps them learn and find things out:	91%	9/12	86%	93%	99%
e) % of adults who think that the library has made a difference to their lives:	87%	6/13	36%	87%	97%
% of children who think that the library has made a difference to their lives:	85%	3/11	57%	73%	93%
QI 4 b) % of attendees of training sessions who said that the training had helped them achieve their goals:	100%	1/17	85%	97%	100%

Quality performance indicators and benchmarks – these indicators do not have targets but allow performance to be compared across the 22 local authorities in Wales. As can be seen, in some areas Cardiff is ranked first in Wales, and in others is amongst the middle or lowest performing local authorities. Members may wish to note the following in relation to quality performance indicators:

- Cardiff has maintained its position as number 1 in terms of library visits per capita and virtual visits per capita (QI 6).
- The use of ICT equipment has fallen from 46% to 35% (QI 11).
- Supply of requests has declined, leaving Cardiff one of the lower ranked authorities.
- Cardiff is ranked number 1 in terms of total volunteers and volunteer hours, with large improvements made on 14/15 figures.

Performance indicator		Rank	Lowest	Median	Highest	2014/15	Rank
QI 1 Making a difference							
a) new skills	71%	8/13	23%	72%	92%		
c) health and well-being	43%	10/13	26%	58%	93%		
d) enjoyable, safe and inclusive	95%	9/13	84%	97%	100%		
QI 2 Customer satisfaction							
a) 'very good' or 'good' choice of books	84%	11/14	74%	89%	97%		
b) 'very good' or 'good' customer care	93%	12/14	90%	97%	99%		
c) 'very good' or 'good' overall	95%	10/14	92%	97%	99%		
d) child rating out of ten	9.5	1/13	8.0	9.2	9.5		
QI 4 User training							
a) attendances per capita	134	2	5	30	390	39	5
c) informal training per capita	278	6/19	3	195	1017	115	15/21
QI 6 Library use							
a) visits per capita	6,185	1	2,467	3,967	6,185	5,955	1
b) virtual visits per capita	2,475	1	340	976	2,475	2,449	1
c) active borrowers per capita	217	3	45	157	273	232	3
QI 7 Attendances at events per capita	293	6	60	223	666	221	9

Page 12

Performance indicator		Rank	Lowest	Median	Highest	2014/15	Rank
QI 11 Use of ICT - % of available time used by the public							
	a) equipment	35%	8	20%	31%	68%	46%	5
	b) Wi-Fi services	n/a		20%	60%	90%	n/k	
QI 12 Supply of requests							
	a) % available within 7 days	68%	18	57%	71%	86%	72%	9
	b) % available within 15 days	77%	20	71%	86%	96%	82%	17
QI 13 Staffing levels and qualifications							
	(v) a) total volunteers	103	1	0	18	103	31	4
	b) total volunteer hours	3,699	1	0	582	3,699	927	6
QI 14 Operational expenditure							
	a) total expenditure per capita	£16,536	6/21	£7,516	£12,749	£18,760	£17,410	4
	b) % on staff	40%	21/21	40%	58%	79%	49%	19
	% on information resources	9%	19/21	7%	13%	23%	10%	20
	% on equipment and buildings	16%	2/21	1%	3%	20%	20%	3
	% on other operational costs	34%	3/21	0%	20%	39%	22%	12
	c) capital expenditure per capita	£4,677	1/21	£0	£272	£4,677	£481	10
QI 15 Net cost per visit		£1.83	21/21	£1.83	£2.43	£3.53	*	
QI 16 Opening hours (see note)							
	(ii) a) % hours unplanned closure of static service points	0.04%	15	0.00%	0.00%	0.16%	0.17%	18
	b) % mobile stops / home deliveries missed	3.49%	17/19	0.00%	0.71%	23.44%	5.4%	19 / 19

11. Highlights from the commentary of the CyMAL assessment report include:

- Adult satisfaction levels are below the median for Wales as a whole, but the results from the children's survey are better.

- Attendance at formal training has increased compared to last year, and is second highest in Wales. Rates of informal training have more than doubled.

- 97% of the population of Cardiff is within easy reach of service points.

- High levels of visits are likely to be a consequence of shared services through Hubs.

- The number of active borrowers has fallen, but remains third highest in Wales.

- Cardiff has trebled its use of volunteers during the year to 103, each giving an average of 36 hours to the service. Half of these are young volunteers recruited to support the Summer Reading Challenge.

12. The concluding remarks of the Annual Assessment report state that *"Cardiff Library Service reports a mixed performance, but is continuing to develop, with strategies designed to deliver improved performance next year. Concern remains with the ongoing low staffing and low acquisition levels, however."*

Page 13

Previous Scrutiny

13.   The Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee monitored performance against the Welsh Public Libraries Standards fourth framework across 2012-14. Members raised the following recurring scrutiny issues during this period:

- staffing levels in libraries in Cardiff are a chronic issue with Cardiff being in the lowest quartile for the whole of Wales;
- qualification levels of staff are below the WLPS standard;
- the levels of new stock acquisitions have been an area of concern.

14.   The Welsh Public Libraries Standards fifth framework was first scrutinised by this Committee in November 2015. Following this meeting, Members wrote to the Cabinet Member to make the following points:

- Members were concerned that the Council was not carrying out the formal feedback surveys required by the Welsh Government, but were reassured that this requirement would be met in full for the 2015/16 annual return;
- Members welcomed the achievement of making superfast broadband available across the libraries in Cardiff, and hoped that this can help close the digital divide that exists across the city;
- Members were concerned that the appropriateness of some measures could be challenged given it was only one year into a three year framework.

Way Forward

15.   Councillor Peter Bradbury (Cabinet Member for Community Development, Co-Operatives and Social Enterprise) will be in attendance, and may wish to make a statement. Sarah McGill (Director – Communities, Housing & Customer Services) and Isabelle Bignall (Head of Service – Customer Services) will be in attendance and will provide a short presentation on Cardiff's performance against the WLPS for 2015/16. They will also be available to answer any questions that Members may have.

B. SUMMER READING CHALLENGE 2016

Purpose of Report

16.   This report enables Members to evaluate the performance of Cardiff in the 2016 Summer Reading Challenge and test plans for the Summer Reading Challenge in summer 2017.

Background

17.   The Summer Reading Challenge is a reading promotion for children aged four to 11 that takes place across the UK. It is run annually by The Reading Agency (an independent charity, whose aim is to "inspire more people to read more", encourage them to share their enjoyment of reading, and celebrate the difference that reading makes to all our lives) through the public library network.

18.   Children's reading can 'dip' during the long school summer holidays and the aim of the Summer Reading Challenge is to address this. The target is to get children to read six or more books from the library during the summer holidays. It is free to join and every child who completes the Challenge receives a certificate. Children can read whatever they like - fact books, joke books, picture books, audio books – the only requirement is that they are borrowed from the library.

19.   The theme for the 2016 Summer Reading Challenge was the Big Friendly Read, linked to celebrations for the centenary of Roald Dahl's birth. In scrutinising the 2015 results, Members were informed that the Council was targeting a 70% completion rate for 2016, and looking to build upon relationships developed in previous years of the Challenge.

Previous Summer Reading Challenge Results

20.   The following results have been achieved in Cardiff between 2013 – 2015:

	2013	**2014**	**2015**
Participation	4853	5,902	5,703
Completion	3207	3,776	3,669
Completion Rate	66.10%	63.98%	64.33%
Issues – children's stock		99,696	127,573

21.   In previous years a wide programme of events have been undertaken to support the Summer Reading Challenge, including:

- School visits

- Author events

- Reading challenge parties

- Workshops

- World record attempts

The full programme of events was widely advertised, including social media such as Facebook and the Cardiff events page (https://goo.gl/5BxNEa).

Previous Scrutiny

22.   Following its consideration of the 2015 Summer Reading Challenge, the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member – Community Development, Co-operatives & Social Enterprise to make the following points:

- Members note that the 70% target was not achieved but recognise it is an ambitious target to be the first authority in Wales to achieve it.

- Members recommend that Elected Members are formally included within planned promotional activities, given their role as school governors and an anticipated willingness for Members to get more involved.

- Members were glad the Council is committed to this initiative and recognise the benefits reach wider than just children's reading,

encouraging adults to visit libraries and raising their awareness of the services they offer.

23. Following its consideration of the 2014 Summer Reading Challenge results in May 2015, the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member: Community Development, Co-operatives & Social Enterprise to make the following points:

- Given the initiative is one that local authorities must opt-in to, Members were glad the Council is committed to supporting young people and addressing the literacy dip that can occur in the summer break.

Way Forward

24. Councillor Peter Bradbury (Cabinet Member: Community Development, Co-operatives and Social Enterprise) has been invited and may wish to give a statement. Sarah McGill (Director of Communities, Housing and Customer Services) and Isabelle Bignall (Assistant Director of Communities and Customer Service) will be in attendance and will provide an overview of the 2016 Summer Reading Challenge and targets for 2017.

Legal Implications

25. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the

Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

26.   The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

Recommendation

27.   The Committee is recommended:

   a.   to consider whether it wishes to pass on any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet;
   b.   to discuss whether it wishes to schedule any further scrutiny of these issues.

Davina Fiore
Director of Governance and Legal Services
4 November 2016

The following Appendix is attached:

Appendix A: *Fifth Assessment Framework for Welsh Public Library Standards: Annual Return 2015/16.*

Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Paul Orders
Chief Executive
City and County of Cardiff Council
County Hall
Atlantic Wharf
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

29 September 2016

Dear Paul,

Fifth Assessment Framework for Welsh Public Library Standards: Annual Return 2015-16

The Public Libraries and Museums Act 1964 sets out the statutory duties of public library authorities to "provide a comprehensive and efficient library service" and makes it a duty of the Welsh Ministers "to superintend and promote the improvement" of public library services in Wales. In accordance with these statutory requirements the Welsh Government has completed its assessment of your authority's library service Annual Return for 2015-16, and the full report is attached to this letter.

This is the second year of assessment under the fifth framework. The independent assessor, in consultation with a Reference Group comprising Welsh Government officials and three heads of library services, found that:

- Cardiff is now meeting of the 18 core entitlements in full.
- Of the seven quality indicators which have targets, Cardiff achieved three in full, two in part and failed to achieve two.
- The return showed good evidence of the impact of the service on its users.
- The library service has key strengths in community engagement and its visitor levels.
- The main areas of concern are the staffing and acquisitions budgets.

I am grateful for the support from your library service in submitting this year's return and liaising with the independent assessor and MALD officials on this important piece of work.

BUDDSODDWYR | INVESTORS
MEWN POBL | IN PEOPLE

We welcome correspondence in Welsh. Correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

Should you have any queries concerning the report or the assessment process, please contact Alyson Tyler, Senior Libraries Development Adviser, tel: 0300 062 2103, email: alyson.tyler@wales.gsi.gov.uk.

Yours sincerely

Jason Thomas

PP Kate Clarke
Museums, Archives and Libraries Department

CC: Library Service Manager
Scrutiny Officer

Welsh Public Library Standards 2014-17

Cardiff

Annual Assessment Report 2015-16

This report has been prepared based on information provided in Cardiff's annual return, case studies and narrative report submitted to Museums, Archives and Libraries Division of the Welsh Government.

1) Executive summary

> Cardiff is now meeting all of the 18 core entitlements in full, an improvement over last year.
>
> Of the 7 quality indicators which have targets, Cardiff achieved 3 in full, 2 in part and failed to achieve 2.
>
> Cardiff library service reports a mixed performance, but is continuing to develop, with strategies designed to deliver improved performance next year. Concern remains with the ongoing low staffing and low acquisition levels, however.

- Four excellent impact case studies were provided which demonstrated a range of impacts on individual users in the areas of well-being, community cohesion and skills development.

- User surveys show high levels of satisfaction amongst children, although adult levels are below the median for Wales. Attendance at formal training sessions is the second highest in Wales, and rates of informal training per capita have increased.

- Physical and virtual visits have increased for the second consecutive year, and both are at the highest levels in Wales, although some other indicators of use have fallen. The service meets the targets for access to service points.

- The overall level of acquisitions remains disappointing, being amongst the lowest in Wales, and this is the only area where Cardiff entirely fails to meet the targets set in the framework, for the second year. Materials for children are prioritised, and resources in the Welsh language are being provided at appropriate levels. ICT provision has improved, and now meets all targets set.

- Staffing levels are among the lowest in Wales, both overall and for professionally qualified staff. More than half of the budget is spent on maintenance, repair and other operational costs. Library closures for refurbishment reduced opening hours below the target set, but the proportion of unplanned closures has been further reduced.

- The figures suggest the service is operating efficiently, with total spending per capita above the median for Wales, but net cost per visit the lowest in Wales, at £1.83

Considering the four areas in the framework (*Customers and communities; Access for all; Learning for life;* and *Leadership and development*) in comparison to the rest of Wales, Cardiff is generally performing well in the broad area of *Access for all*. Performance in the remaining areas is mixed.

Compared to the previous year, Cardiff has improved its performance in the areas of user training, online access, and unplanned closures. The speed of supply of requests has declined, and more volunteers have been used to supplement the service.

2) Performance against the standards

The standards framework comprises of core entitlements, quality indicators with targets, quality indicators with benchmarks and impact measures. Section 2 summarises achievements against the core entitlements, the quality indicators which have targets, the quality indicators showing performance against others, and impact measures. A narrative assessment of the authority's performance is made in Section 3.

a) Core entitlements

Cardiff is meeting all of the 18 core entitlements in full. This is an improvement over the previous year, following a consultation exercise in February 2016 with library users.

b) Quality indicators with targets

There are 16 quality indicators (QI) within the framework. Of the 7 which have targets, Cardiff is achieving 3 in full, 2 in part and is failing to achieve 2 of the indicators:

Quality Indicator	Met?	
QI 3 Individual development:		Met in full
a) ICT support	✔	
b) Skills training	✔	
c) Information literacy	✔	
d) E-government support	✔	
e) Reader development	✔	
QI 5 Location of service points	✔	Met in full
QI 8 Up-to-date reading material:		Not met
a) Acquisitions per capita	✘	
or Materials spend per capita	✘	
b) Replenishment rate	✘	
QI 9 Appropriate reading material:		Partially met
a) % of material budget on children	✘	
b) % of material budget spent on Welsh	✘	
or Spend on Welsh per capita	✔	
QI 10 Online access:		Met in full
a) All service points	✔	
Computers per capita	✔	
b) Wi-Fi provision	✔	
QI 13 Staffing levels and qualifications:		Partially met
a) Staff per capita	✘	
b) Professional staff per capita	✘	
c) Head of service qualification/training	✔	
d) CPD percentage	✔	
QI 16 Opening hours per capita	✘	Not met

In 2014-15, Cardiff achieved 4 indicators in full, 2 in part and failed to achieve 1. Performance has improved on QI 10, which is now achieved in full, but declined on QI 9, and QI 16. Note that the target for spending on children's materials is set to be within two percentage points of the proportion of children in the population, and the missed target is due to exceeding the range proportionally, rather than a shortfall, as the service has prioritised materials for children.

Page 22

c) Impact measures

The framework contains three indicators which seek to gather evidence of the impact that using the library service has on people's lives. Through these and other indicators it is possible to see how the library service is contributing towards educational, social, economic and health and wellbeing local and national agendas. These indicators do not have targets. Not all authorities collected data for the impact indicators, and ranks are included out of the numbers of respondents stated, where 1 is the highest scoring authority.

Cardiff undertook a customer survey of both adults and children in February 2016. Note that the percentage of attendees of training sessions who said that the training had helped them achieve their goals is based on a very small sample of just 44 responses.

Performance indicator		Rank	Lowest	Median	Highest
QI 1 Making a difference					
b) % of children who think that the library helps them learn and find things out:	91%	9/12	86%	93%	99%
e) % of adults who think that the library has made a difference to their lives:	87%	6/13	36%	87%	97%
% of children who think that the library has made a difference to their lives:	85%	3/11	57%	73%	93%
QI 4 b) % of attendees of training sessions who said that the training had helped them achieve their goals:	100%	1/17	85%	97%	100%

Cardiff provided 4 outstanding impact case studies which showed the real difference the library service makes:

- A work experience volunteer who gained paid employment as a consequence

- A young woman with mental health issues who has gained in confidence and seen a real improvement in her mental health from participating in weekly Goldies sessions

- A poetry competition for year 5 children which boosted the confidence of the participants, some of whom had been previously reluctant to engage in literacy. A creative writing club has been formed as a result

- A disabled woman, previously isolated, who now has a reason to socialise, and has become engaged to be married as a result.

d) Quality performance indicators and benchmarks

The remaining indicators do not have targets, but allow performance to be compared between authorities. The following table summarises Cardiff's position for 2015-16. Ranks are included out of 22, where 1 is the highest, and 22 the lowest scoring authority, unless stated otherwise. Indicators where fewer than 22 authorities supplied data are obtained from customer surveys which only need to be carried out once during the three year framework period, or those where relevant data elements were not available to some authorities. Figures reported in respect of last year for QI 4 to QI 16 are repeated for convenience of comparison. Note that indicators 'per capita' are calculated per 1,000 population.

Performance indicator	Rank	Lowest	Median	Highest	2014/15	Rank
QI 1 Making a difference						
a) new skills	71%	8/13	23%	72%	92%	
c) health and well-being	43%	10/13	26%	58%	93%	
d) enjoyable, safe and inclusive	95%	9/13	84%	97%	100%	
QI 2 Customer satisfaction						

<div style="text-align:center">Page 23</div>

Performance indicator		Rank	Lowest	Median	Highest	2014/15	Rank
a) 'very good' or 'good' choice of books	84%	11/14	74%	89%	97%		
b) 'very good' or 'good' customer care	93%	12/14	90%	97%	99%		
c) 'very good' or 'good' overall	95%	10/14	92%	97%	99%		
d) child rating out of ten	9.5	1/13	8.0	9.2	9.5		
QI 4 User training							
a) attendances per capita	134	2	5	30	390	39	5
c) informal training per capita	278	6/19	3	195	1017	115	15 / 21
QI 6 Library use							
a) visits per capita	6,185	1	2,467	3,967	6,185	5,955	1
b) virtual visits per capita	2,475	1	340	976	2,475	2,449	1
c) active borrowers per capita	217	3	45	157	273	232	3
QI 7 Attendances at events per capita	293	6	60	223	666	221	9
QI 11 Use of ICT - % of available time used by the public							
a) equipment	35%	8	20%	31%	68%	46%	5
b) Wi-Fi services	n/a		20%	60%	90%	n/k	
QI 12 Supply of requests							
a) % available within 7 days	68%	18	57%	71%	86%	72%	9
b) % available within 15 days	77%	20	71%	86%	96%	82%	17
QI 13 Staffing levels and qualifications							
(v) a) total volunteers	103	1	0	18	103	31	4
b) total volunteer hours	3,699	1	0	582	3,699	927	6
QI 14 Operational expenditure							
a) total expenditure per capita	£16,536	6/21	£7,516	£12,749	£18,760	£17,410	4
b) % on staff	40%	21/21	40%	58%	79%	49%	19
% on information resources	9%	19/21	7%	13%	23%	10%	20
% on equipment and buildings	16%	2/21	1%	3%	20%	20%	3
% on other operational costs	34%	3/21	0%	20%	39%	22%	12
c) capital expenditure per capita	£4,677	1/21	£0	£272	£4,677	£481	10
QI 15 Net cost per visit	£1.83	21/21	£1.83	£2.43	£3.53	*	
QI 16 Opening hours (see note)							
(ii) a) % hours unplanned closure of static service points	0.04%	15	0.00%	0.00%	0.16%	0.17%	18
b) % mobile stops / home deliveries missed	3.49%	17/19	0.00%	0.71%	23.44%	5.4%	19 / 19

Note: Rankings here have been reversed, so that 1 is the lowest scoring (best performing) authority.

* Income data for 2014-15 not available to calculate this figure.

3) Analysis of performance

The core entitlements and quality indicators are divided into four key areas. This section of the report outlines performance against the quality indicators within these four areas, and compares results with those from the first year of the framework.

a) Customers and communities

Cardiff carried out customer surveys in February 2016. Adult satisfaction levels are below the median for Wales as a whole, but the results from the children's survey are better, with the highest rating of those authorities which have carried out a survey in the current framework. All static service points are providing the full range of services in support of individual development. Attendance at formal training has increased compared to last year, and is the second highest in Wales. Rates of informal training reported have more than doubled, and

Page 24

are now above the median for Wales.

b) *Access for all*

Cardiff meets the target for access to service points, with 97% of the population within easy reach. Both physical and virtual visits per capita have increased for the second consecutive year, and remain the highest in Wales. The high level of visits to library premises is likely to be a consequence of shared services being rolled out as Hubs, with visitor counting not distinguishing between library visitors and those coming only to use other services. Although the number of library members has increased, the number of active borrowers has fallen since last year, but it remains the third highest in Wales, at 21.7% of the population. Attendance at events per capita has increased, by almost one third. Book and audio-visual issues have both fallen; audio visual issues per capita are now the second lowest in Wales and this is an area of concern which the service may wish to investigate.

c) *Learning for life*

The rate of acquisitions remains low in both absolute and replenishment terms, and the targets in this area have not been met for the second year. There has been a small increase in the number of acquisitions per capita, and the authority notes that a stock review has not taken place for a number of years. Cardiff has prioritised spending on children, with 24% of the budget compared to 18% of children in the population; however they note that 31% of customers are children accounting for 32% of issues.

Cardiff now meets the targets for online access, following an increase in the number of PCs available and improvements to the Wi-Fi network. As a result, percentage usage has fallen, but an improvement is anticipated next year following promotion of the service. Cardiff is unable to measure the hours of Wi-Fi network usage, but notes a significant increase in customers using their own devices, and reported a usage figure in Gigabytes of data accessed.

There has been a fall in the speed of delivery of requests, over both 7 and 15 days, compared to last year, following a remapping of stock alignment processes; an improvement is anticipated next year.

d) *Leadership and development*

There have been further falls in staffing levels, and the targets are not met. The service is working with CILIP to provide staff with information regarding qualifications and routes to Chartership. The level of staff training has fallen compared to last year, but the target continues to be met in this area. The operational manger of the service is a Chartered Librarian. Cardiff has trebled its use of volunteers during the year, to 103, each giving an average of 36 hours to the service. Half were Young Volunteers recruited to support the Summer Reading Challenge.

The service has experienced a further 5% cut in its revenue budget although spending per capita remains above the median for Wales. More than half of the total is now spent on maintenance, repair and other operational costs. The average gross cost per visit has fallen to £1.91, compared to £2.07 last year, and remains the lowest in Wales. This is a result of the increase in visits due to shared Hub facilities.

The temporary closure of several locations for refurbishment during the year has resulted in reduced opening hours so that this target has not been met this year, but improvement is expected next year. Cardiff had the highest level of capital expenditure per capita in Wales

this year. The service has further reduced the proportion of unplanned closures and missed mobile library stops.

4) Strategic context

Cardiff provided an extensive statement outlining its contribution to wider Welsh Government and local authority priorities. Considerable investment has been made in rolling out the hub strategy to deliver services with an emphasis on digital literacy. Health and well-being is also prioritised.

5) Future direction

The continued roll-out of the hub strategy and a focus on the digital literacy agenda are priorities, in a climate of continuing financial challenge. The service is also aligning activity with the aims of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act.

6) Conclusion

Cardiff library service reports a mixed performance, but is continuing to develop, with strategies designed to deliver improved performance next year. Concern remains with the ongoing low staffing and low acquisition levels, however.

Page 26

CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

DINAS A SIR CAERDYDD

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE   11 NOVEMBER 2016

DUMBALLS ROAD REGENERATION

Supplementary information to this report is exempt from publication because it contains information of the kind described in paragraphs 14 and 21 of parts 4 and 5 of Schedule 12A to the Local Government Act 1972. It is viewed that, in all the circumstances of the case, the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information.

Purpose of Report

1.   To prepare Members of the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee to scrutinise proposals coming forward that will facilitate a Regeneration Scheme at Dumballs Road Regeneration Scheme.

Background

2.   In 2013, the Welsh Government launched five Enterprise Zones across Wales, located in Cardiff, Anglesey, Deeside, St Athan and Ebbw Vale. More recently Enterprise Zones have been established in Snowdonia, Haven Waterfront and Port Talbot. The Cardiff Central Enterprise Zone was marketed as a Business District with a particular focus on the financial and professional advisory services.

3.   Enterprise Zones are geographic areas dedicated to provide business infrastructure, support and incentives to attract businesses and stimulate economic growth and prosperity. Examples of the support available include financial incentives (grants, loans and business rate reductions), access to markets, close proximity to supply chain and customers, access to local academia, high speed broadband.

4. Almost one third of the Cardiff Central Enterprise Zone is accounted for in the Dumballs Road site, located south of Cardiff Central Train Station. This is a brownfield site which has been allocated for housing-led mixed use developments. A series of unsuccessful schemes have been privately developed in recent years, with many of the Option Agreements expiring at the end of 2016.

5. The Economic Development Directorate Delivery Plan 2016-18, considered by this Committee on 7 April 2016, contains the 'key aspiration' for 2016-17 to *"Unlock the Dumballs Road Regeneration Scheme"*.

Way Forward

6. This item will be considered in closed session allowing Members and witnesses to discuss the information deemed commercially sensitive.

7. The Leader, Councillor Phil Bale will be in attendance, and may wish to make a statement. Neil Hanratty (Director – Economic Development) will be in attendance and will provide a short presentation on the proposals for Dumballs Road. They will also be available to answer any questions that Members may have.

Legal Implications

8. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d)

be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

9.   The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

Recommendation

10.   The Committee is recommended:

        a) Note the contents of the report and discussions during the meeting;
        b) Consider whether it wishes to make any comments to the Cabinet

Davina Fiore
Director, Governance and Legal Services
10 November 2016

This page is intentionally left blank